April 17, 2025

Subject:	**Racial Equity Commission February 20, 2025 Data Committee Meeting Minutes**
Prepared By:	**Joyce Chiao, Consultant, Abundance**
Reviewed By:	**Toya Davis, Operations Manager, Racial Equity Commission**

Recommended Action

Approval of the February 20, 2025, Racial Equity Commission Data Committee Meeting Minutes.

Racial Equity Commission Data Committee February 20, 2025 - Meeting Minutes

Agenda Item #1: Welcome

A. CALL TO ORDER: Commissioner Matthews called the meeting to order at 3:00 PM. Noted that he would be facilitating in the absence of Committee Lead Pastor. Shared a reminder that the Commission condemns acts of hate and discrimination. Commissioner Matthews shared the CA vs Hate resource line.

B. REVIEW OF THE AGENDA

C. ESTABLISHMENT OF QUORUM: Quorum Met; 2/3 Commissioners Present

Commissioners Present:

1. Commissioner Traco Matthews (Virtually)
2. Commissioner Yolanda Richardson (Virtually)

Commissioners Absent:

1. Commissioner Dr. Manuel Pastor, Committee Lead

D. PUBLIC COMMENT PROCESS

Public Comment

No public comment.

Agenda Item #2: Public Comment on matters not on the agenda

No public comment.

Agenda Item #3: ACTION: Approval of July 17, 2024 Meeting Minutes

Commissioner Traco Matthews, Committee Member

Dr. Larissa Estes, Executive Director, Racial Equity Commission

Committee Discussion

No Committee discussion.

Public Comment

No public comment.

Motion by Commissioner Richardson and seconded by Commissioner Matthews.

Motion passes (2-0-1*). *Marks abstention or absence from vote.

Agenda Item #4: PANEL DISCUSSION: Data Visuals Used as a Tool to Advance Racial Equity

Commissioner Traco Matthews, Committee Member

Dr. Larissa Estes, Executive Director, Racial Equity Commission

Jon Schwabish, Senior Fellow, Urban Institute

Andrea Aguair, Racial Equity Manager, Office of Racial Equity and Social Equity at the City of San Jose

Sophia Garcia, Equity and Civic Nonprofits Lead, Environmental Systems Research Institute (ESRI)

Panel Discussion

Estes: How does data visualization influence public perception of racial equity issues?

Garcia: Data problems are geographic problems. Everything can be visualized in a map. Data can purposely be confusing. Want to uplift two existing California State index maps. One is Cal Enviro Screen, a statewide index that outlays environmental impacts and indicators. Uses clear colors of green and red to indicate good and bad. Second is the California Air Resources Board (CARB) index map of air quality reports. CARB conducts critical community engagement to understand whether data is accurate. Present data in a way that is digestible.

Estes: What does GIS stand for?

Garcia: Geographic Information Systems.

Estes: Jon, what is your take on the influence of data visualization on public perception and understanding racial equity?

Schwabish: Agree with Sophia. Would highlight three points. First, graphics can mislead people, which is a concern in the age of misinformation. Would add the issue of deficit framing. Could use asset framing and analyze the root causes that have contributed to the trends that we see. Second, how you order results in your visualization is important. Third, exploring equity broadly around ethnicity, country of origin, accessibility.

Estes: Andrea, what is your perspective on the influence of data visualization on public perception and understanding racial equity?

Aguiar: A lot of opportunity with data visualization and intersectionality. Lead with race, but do not end there. Data needs to be digestible and accessible. Acknowledge federal standards for

data visualization. Agree with strengths-based data narratives that reflect how the community would share their own narratives. Data visualization provides a very quick snapshot for busy leaders and policymakers.

Estes: Highlight intersectionality of community engagement, data, how data is presented, and how decision-makers use that data. Jon, can you speak to anecdotal data, in storytelling and interviews, and how that can be part of data visualization?

Schwabish: Presented a 1930s redlining map of Chicago. Noted how the impacts of these maps continue to impact many facets, including segregation, urban renewal, income inequality, climate, and broadband access. Go out and talk to people and communities. Lead the Do Not Harm Project. Interview people, and find those people by being involved in your community to combine quantitative and qualitative data.

Estes: How can data visualization contribute to greater transparency in government and increased collaborative efforts between government and communities to address racial inequities?

Aguiar: Highlighted the City of San Jose Racial and Social Equity Ordinance and the Equity Values and Standards Policy. Adopted in May 2024. Set standards and values for accountability to advance racial equity work. Codified how to move racial equity in our work. Also important to disaggregate data. All departments are required to create a racial equity action plan, which is published on the City of San Jose website. Paired racial equity action plan with dashboards. Creates accountability for community. Work with policy decision-makers to use this data.

Estes: Sophia, how can data visualizations be helpful in gathering and presenting aggregate data that is happening in many different places?

Garcia: Presented a quick map using ESRI software. Emphasized the need for more learning and community engagement to be embedded into GIS industry and practices. One example of data visualization to gather and present aggregate data is the City of Tacoma, which reviews every policy through the Tacoma Equity Index. Second example is the City of Tucson, which has a four-step equity action plan. Equity Office has a comprehensive community engagement strategy. Questionnaire is available in different languages. Being mindful that community engagement is not extractive. Third example is Los Angeles County, which has a State of Black Los Angeles County report.

Estes: What are your two key takeaways on data visualization as a tool to advance racial equity, and what does the Commission and the Data Committee really need to know about data visualization?

Aguiar: The ability to codify standards and values in the charter has been really important. Community engagement is important in how that data and story is told.

Garcia: Connecting with GIS staff at the state level. Document decision-making on what indicators that you have chosen and why.

Schwabish: Equity is important in the entire data ecosystem, from data collection to analysis to visualization. Importance of value that the data visualization team and others, such as

communications team, has in this process to engage with an equity lens. One example is who is responsible for writing alternative text. Ultimately decided that it was the researcher.

Committee Discussion

Richardson: Appreciated idea of intersectionality. Valued conversation around community and equity. Thinking about data accessibility.

Matthews: Expressed appreciation for panelists and their concrete examples.

Public Comment

No public comment.

Agenda Item #5: 15-Minute Recess

Commissioner Traco Matthews, Committee Member

Dr. Larissa Estes, Executive Director, Racial Equity Commission

Committee Member Matthews called a recess at 4:08 PM.

Committee Lead Matthews called the meeting to order at 4:23 PM.

Agenda Item #6: ACTION: Discussion of Key Considerations and Additional Research

- Due to the absence of Commissioner Pastor, the Committee agreed that more time for discussion was needed in future meetings. No action was taken for this agenda item.

Commissioner Traco Matthews, Committee Lead

Dr. Larissa Estes, Executive Director, Racial Equity Commission

Joyce Chiao, Consultant, Abundance

Committee Discussion

Richardson: Emphasis on accessibility of the data. Thinking through the users of the data.

Matthews: Thinking about annual equity report, which is actionable and can support sustainability.

Estes: Noted that Executive Order does require an annual report. Eventually will need to discuss what goes into this report.

Richardson: Consider audience of the report and posting of the report.

Matthews: Brought forth thoughts from Commissioner Pastor. Identify how the measure and tracking of outcomes are made transparent, especially by geographical area and where investments are going. Recommended partnership with organizations such as ESRI to disaggregate data effectively by geography and special populations. Leverage universities to disaggregate data.

Richardson: Agree with idea of investments. Noted AB 17-26 as a model for data disaggregation within California.

Matthews: Last recommendation from Commissioner Pastor focused on training. Need more trainings on qualitative data analysis. Loved the strengths-based component of telling the story of data. Suggested qualitative data analysis trainings available for state agencies. Training should support agencies in knowing how to use language to present data.

Estes: Connected these recommendations to the Implementation and Technical Assistance Committee. Connected the conversation around accessibility to the December Community Engagement Committee Meeting, which included a focus on using plain language.

Richardson: Need to discuss oversight and who is responsible for implementation.

Estes: Discuss as a full Commission.

Matthews: Brought forth tactical recommendations from Commissioner Pastor on data-sharing. Looking at California Policy Lab, UCs, Employee Development Department, and Department of Labor in terms of how they share relevant data. Sharing data is a choice and often a process to get there. Important to choose data-sharing as a value.

Richardson: Explore other efforts where data-sharing is happening, despite resistance.

Matthews: Affirmed this idea by Commissioner Richardson.

Chiao: Summarized tools and methodologies. First, data accessibility, such as data-sharing, plain language, and alt text. Second, data disaggregation, including by geography and population. Third, partnerships. Fourth, annual equity report. Fifth, training as capacity-building for qualitative data analysis, data visualization, language, accessibility.

Richardson: Agreed with summary.

Matthews: Reiterated usability and utility of the data.

Chiao: Summarized additional research areas. First, exploring models such as AB 17-26 where data disaggregation is already happening in the state. Second, oversight for implementation.

Public Comment

No public comment.

Agenda Item #7: Next Steps for Staff Action

Commissioner Traco Matthews, Committee Member

Dr. Larissa Estes, Executive Director, Racial Equity Commission

Committee Discussion

No Committee discussion.

Agenda Item #8: Meeting Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 5:01 PM.